### DECISION OF THE HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

CLASS 3 MAJOR HISTORIC DESIGN REVIEW CASE NO.: HIS24-19

APPLICATION NO.: 24-118662-PLN

NOTICE OF DECISION DATE: October 23, 2024

**SUMMARY:** A proposal to install a reconstruction of the historic "ELSINORE" blade sign c.1928 and restore aspects of the marquee and entrance area.

**REQUEST**: A proposal to install a reconstruction of the c. 1928 historic "Elsinore" blade sign, install more period appropriate lighting to replace non-historic ones and add 2 message boards on the marquee, and replace deteriorated non-historic tile in the entrance alcove and door hardware on the Elsinore Theatre (1926), a historic contributing building in Salem's Downtown Historic District, zoned CB (Central Business District), and located at 170 High Street SE; 97301; Marion County Assessor's Map and Tax Lot number: 073W27AB02100.

**APPLICANT:** Historic Elsinore Theatre

LOCATION: 170 High St SE, Salem OR 97301

**CRITERIA:** Salem Revised Code (SRC) Chapters 230.065 – General guidelines for historic contributing resources.

FINDINGS: The findings are in the attached Decision dated October 17, 2024.

**DECISION:** The **Historic Landmarks Commission DENIED** the electronic message boards and **APPROVES** the remainder of the proposal for Class 3 Major Historic Design Review Case No. HIS24-19 based on the application deemed complete on September 25, 2024.

Yes 6

No 0 Absent 3 (Maglinte-Timbrook, Strong, Weathers)

Kirsten Straus, Chair Historic Landmarks Commission

The rights granted by the attached decision must be exercised, or an extension granted, by <u>November 8, 2026</u>, or this approval shall be null and void.

Application Deemed Complete: Public Hearing Date: Notice of Decision Mailing Date: Decision Effective Date: State Mandate Date: <u>September 25, 2024</u> October 17, 2024 October 23, 2024 November 8, 2024 January 23, 2025

PLANNING DIVISION 555 LIBERTY ST. SE, RM 305 SALEM, OREGON 97301 PHONE: 503-588-6173 FAX: 503-588-6005



HIS24-19 Notice of Decision October 23, 2024 Page 2

Case Manager: Jacob Morris, jimorris@cityofsalem.net, 503-540-2417

This decision is final unless written appeal and associated fee (if applicable) from an aggrieved party is filed with the City of Salem Planning Division, Room 320, 555 Liberty Street SE, Salem OR 97301, or by email at <u>planning@cityofsalem.net</u>, no later than <u>5:00 p.m. Thursday, November 7, 2024</u>. Any person who presented evidence or testimony at the hearing may appeal the decision. The notice of appeal must contain the information required by SRC 300.1020 and must state where the decision failed to conform to the provisions of the applicable code section, SRC Chapter(s) 230. The appeal fee must be paid at the time of filing. If the appeal is untimely and/or lacks the proper fee, the appeal will be rejected. The Hearings Officer will review the appeal at a public hearing. After the hearing, the Hearings Officer may amend, rescind, or affirm the action, or refer the matter to staff for additional information.

The complete case file, including findings, conclusions and conditions of approval, if any, is available for review by contacting the case manager, or at the Planning Desk in the Permit Application Center, Room 305, City Hall, 555 Liberty Street SE, during regular business hours.

http://www.cityofsalem.net/planning

### DECISION OF THE SALEM HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

CASE NO.: Historic Design Review Case No. HIS24-19

**FINDINGS:** Based upon the application materials, the facts and findings in the Staff Report incorporated herein by reference, and testimony provided at the Public Hearing of the October 17, 2024 Historic Landmarks Commission (HLC) finds that the applicant adequately demonstrated that their proposal complies with the applicable provisions of the Salem Revised Code (SRC) 230.065 as follows:

### **FINDINGS**

The HLC finds that per SRC 900.070(a), "no electronic display sign shall be allowed within a historic district." Therefore, HLC denies the proposed electronic message boards.

**230.065. GENERAL GUIDELINES FOR HISTORIC CONTRIBUTING RESOURCES.** In lieu of the standards for historic contributing buildings set forth in SRC 230.025 and SRC 230.040, an applicant may make a proposal for preservation, restoration, or rehabilitation activity, regardless of type of work, which shall conform to the following guidelines:

(a) Except as otherwise provided in this Chapter, the property shall be used for its historic purpose, or for a similar purpose that will not alter street access, landscape design, entrance(s), height, footprint, fenestration, or massing.

**Finding:** Property is used as a theater/performing arts center. This is a continuation of the historic purpose of the resource. The HLC finds that SRC 230.065(a) has been met.

(b) Historic materials, finishes and distinctive features shall, when possible, be preserved and repaired according to historic preservation methods, rather than restored.

**Finding:** Although the current marquee and entry/ticket area visually resemble the appearance of the theatre during the historic period, these elements were restored in 1983, reversing previous alterations. Historic images taken in the mid-1970s depict a marquee and entrance alcove that had been heavily modified, which removed or damaged related historic materials, finishes and distinctive features. Since the original materials no longer exist, preservation and repair are no longer options, leaving restoration as the most sensitive viable treatment, since the historic design is retained.

Similarly, the most recent rooftop parapet ornamentation was made of wood as a replacement for the original terra cotta and was likely installed in 2002. Photos suggest that this was the third iteration of these distinctive, architectural pieces. After 20 years, the most recent pieces required removal for safety. Therefore, restoration of this design feature is the most sensitive remaining treatment.

The proposed Elsinore blade sign is a reconstruction of a missing distinctive feature, so no historic materials, finishes or distinctive features are available. Reconstruction is the only available treatment to restore the historic visual appearance of the theatre.

Based on this analysis, the HLC finds that SRC 230.065(b) has been met.

(c) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship significance shall be treated with sensitivity.

HIS24-19 Decision October 17, 2024 Page 2

**Finding:** The portions of the proposal related to reconstructing the parapet and "Elsinore" blade sign elements are not impacting historic materials, instead they are replacing missing features, therefore the craftsmanship embodied in any historic material assemblies are not impacted. However, the treatments proposed retain the features necessary to convey the distinctive theme of the theater. The addition of the blade sign will return a stylistic feature integral to the design of this and almost all historic theatres of the era. The remaining aspects of the proposal, such as the proposed alterations of details, such as the added ornamentation to the entrance tile and the marquee soffit pinstriping, are minor, and do not significantly impact the overall character of the exterior and are consistent with the style of the building. For these reasons, the HLC finds that SRC 230.065 (c) has been met.

# (d) Historic features shall be restored or reconstructed only when supported by physical or photographic evidence.

**Finding:** This project does include restoration or reconstruction of features, including the vertical blade sign, the rooftop crown ornamentation, and the under-marquee light fixtures, and tiled wall base. Photographic evidence is included for the following items:

- Vertical "Elsinore" blade sign (Exhibits A and B)
- Rooftop parapet ornamentation (Exhibits A and B)
- School house lights under the marquee (Exhibit E)
- Soffit ornamentation under the marquee (Exhibit D)
- Individual aluminum shades for marquee lightbulbs (Exhibit B)
- Tile base on exterior walls (Exhibit E)

All of the proposed features above relatively closely follow historic images. Only one image has been found that is of an angle that shows how the soffit panels under marquee appeared historically. This angle of this image does not allow close inspection of the exact design, but it does clearly show that there was more ornamental detail historically than currently exists. The pinstripes subtly return some of the level of detail. Therefore, the HLC finds that SRC 230.065(d) has been met.

(e) Changes that have taken place to a historic resource over the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a historic resource and its environment and should be recognized and respected. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance should be recognized and respected.

**Finding:** The proposal does not adversely impact any intact features that have acquired significance to the Elsinore. The early 1970s alterations that were reversed in 1983 fall outside of the Period of Significance for the property and district. Therefore, the HLC finds that SRC 230.065(e) has been met.

(f) Additions and alterations to a historic resource shall be designed and constructed to minimize changes to the historic resource.

**Finding:** Overall, the proposal has been designed to restore historically significant features, most notably the sign and parapet elements. Since the sign is proposed to be attached in the

HIS24-19 Decision October 17, 2024 Page 3

same location as the historic sign, installation will require little or no changes to the historic resource.

Other changes, such as the proposed alterations of details like the added ornamentation to the tile and the marquee soffit pinstriping, are only minimal changes that are compatible and do not adversely affect the significant features of the Elsinore. Therefore, the HLC finds that SRC 230.065(f) has been met.

(g) Additions and alterations shall be constructed with the least possible loss of historic materials and so that significant features are not obscured, damaged, or destroyed.

**Finding:** Significant features will not be damaged or destroyed. The blade sign and rooftop features were historic features, so the new installations will use historic attachment points. The entrance tile was similarly installed as a replacement in 1983, so no historic tile is being replaced, but the historic size, color, and field pattern of the historic tile are significant features that are being retained.

Therefore, the HLC finds that SRC 230.065(g) has been met.

(h) Structural deficiencies in a historic resource shall be corrected without visually changing the composition, design, texture or other visual qualities.

**Finding:** The applicant is not proposing to correct any structural deficiencies as part of this proposal; therefore, The HLC finds that this guideline is not applicable to the evaluation of this proposal.

(i) Excavation or re-grading shall not be allowed adjacent to or within the site of a historic resource which could cause the foundation to settle, shift, or fail, or have a similar effect on adjacent historic resources.

**Finding:** The applicant is not proposing to any excavation or regrading as part of this proposal; therefore, The HLC finds that this guideline is not applicable to the evaluation of this proposal.

#### DECISION

The Historic Landmarks Commission **DENIES** the electronic message boards.

The Historic Landmarks Commission APPROVES the remainder of the proposal.

#### VOTE: Yes 6 No 0 Abstain 0 Absent 3 (Maglinte-Timbrook, Strong, Weathers)

- Attachments: A. Vicinity Map
  - B. Excerpt from Applicant's Submittal Materials

Prepared by Jacob Morris, Historic Preservation Planner

\\allcity\CDGroup\CD\PLANNING\HISTORIC\CASE APPLICATION Files - Processing Documents & Staff Reports\Major Type III\2024\Decisions\HIS24-19 170 High St SE. Decision Findings.doc

## ATTACHMENT A



G:\CD\PLANNING\HISTORIC\VICINITY MAPS for Historic Review Cases\170 High St SE.mxd - 7/19/2013 @ 3:31:45 PM











# Elsinore Theatre, 170 High St SE, Salem, OR 97301

# AlphaArchitectural Signs & Lighting A Division of IEC SERVICES Final Design SEPT 1 24

5410 Warehouse Way. Sacramento, CA 95826 916-379-0225 Final Design REV. APRIL 15 24 Final Design REV. JUNE 14 24





4'-0"

# D/F BLADE SIGN







BACK



Final Design SEPT 1 24









SCHOOL HOUSE LAMPS





# SOFFIT





Final Design SEPT 1 24

# ENTRANCE ELEVATION



