

# **HEARING NOTICE**

### LAND USE REQUEST AFFECTING THIS AREA

There is a development proposal for the property listed in this notice and shown on the attached map. The City is seeking input from neighbors on the proposal. If you have questions or comments about the proposal, contact the case manager.

Esta carta es un aviso sobre una propuesta de desarrollo para la propiedad enumerada y que se muestra en el mapa adjunto. La ciudad está buscando la opinión de los vecinos sobre la propuesta. Si tiene preguntas o comentarios sobre la propuesta, póngase en contacto con nosotros al 503-588-6213

liene preguntas o comentarios sobre la propuesta, porigase en contacto con nosotros al 505-500-02 15			
CASE NUMBER:	APPEAL of Urban Growth Preliminary Declaration / Class 3 Site Plan Review / Class 2 Adjustment / Class 1 Adjustment / Class 2 Driveway Approach Permit / Class 1 Design Review / Property Line Adjustment Case No. UGA-SPR-ADJ- DAP-DR-PLA24-03		
PROPERTY LOCATION:	4650 Hazelgreen Road NE, Salem OR 97305		
PROPOSAL SUMMARY:	Appeal of the Planning Administrator's Decision to approve a proposed development of a new 405-unit multi-family residential development containing 33 residential buildings.		
HEARING INFORMATION:	<u>CITY COUNCIL, Monday, April 8, 2024, at 6:00 p.m., Council Chambers,</u> Room 240, Civic Center, 555 Liberty Street SE, Salem, OR 97301		
	Interested persons may view the meeting online at City of Salem Facebook, CCTV Salem, You Tube Channel, or watch on Comcast Cable CCTV Channel 21.		
HOW TO PROVIDE TESTIMONY:	Both written and oral testimony will be accepted on this proposal. Only those participating by submitting written testimony, or by testifying at the hearing, have the right to appeal the decision.		
	Any person wishing to speak either for or against the proposed request may do so in person or by representative at the Public Hearing. Written comments may also be submitted at the Public Hearing. Include case number with the written comments. Prior to the Public Hearing, written comments may be filed with the City Recorder, 555 Liberty Street SE, Room 225, Salem, OR 97301 or by emailing <u>cityrecorder@cityofsalem.net</u> .		
	If unable to attend the meeting in person but would like to provide testimony via Zoom, please sign up between 8:00 a.m. and 4:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting at the following link: <u>https://www.cityofsalem.net/comment-at-council</u> .		
CASE MANAGER:	Aaron Panko, Planner III, City of Salem Planning Division, 555 Liberty Street SE, Room 305, Salem, Oregon 97301. Telephone: 503-540-2356; E-mail: <a href="mailto:apanko@cityofsalem.net">apanko@cityofsalem.net</a> .		
STAFF REPORT:	A copy of the staff report will be available no later than 5:00 p.m., April 1, 2024; copies can be requested from the Planning Division at 503-588-6173. The staff report will also be available online no later than 5:00 p.m., April 3, 2024 at: <u>https://salem.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx</u>		
ACCESS:	The Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) accommodations will be provided on request.		
OWNER(S):	North Place Apartments Phase 2 LLC, represented by Kiril Ivanov and Patricia		

	Jones.
APPLICANT / AGENT(S):	AKS Engineering and Forestry
NEIGHBORHOOD ASSOCIATION:	Neighborhood associations (N.A.) are volunteer organizations of neighbors coming together to make neighborhoods the best they can be. They receive notice of land use applications within their boundaries, and they often submit comments on the applications to the City. Neighborhood association meetings are open to everyone. Contact your neighborhood association to get involved: Northgate Neighborhood Association; Email: northgateneighborhoodsalem@gmail.com.
PROPOSAL REQUEST:	<ul> <li>Appeal of the Planning Administrator's Decision to approve an Urban Growth Area Preliminary Declaration to determine the public facilities required to serve the subject property, a Class 3 Site Plan Review and Class 1 Design Review for the development of a new 405-unit multi-family residential development, Class 2 Driveway Approach Permits for four new driveway approaches on proposed Lunar Drive NE, a Property Line Adjustment to eliminate an interior lot line, and the following Adjustments:</li> <li>1) Class 1 Adjustment to reduce the setback requirement for Buildings 1 and 2 adjacent to a Hazelgreen Road NE from 20 feet per SRC 514.010(d), Table 514-4, to 16 feet;</li> <li>2) Class 2 Adjustment to reduce the vehicle use area setback adjacent to Lunar Drive NE for one parking space near Building 33 from 12 feet per SRC 514.010(d), Table 514-4, to 6.2 feet;</li> <li>3) Class 2 Adjustment to reduce the setback requirement for Building 33 adjacent to a Lunar Drive NE from 20 feet per SRC 514.010(d), Table 514- 4, to approximately 12 feet;</li> <li>4) Class 2 Adjustment to increase the maximum setback allowance adjacent to a street for Buildings 3, 4, and 5 from 10 feet per SRC 533.015(c), Table 533-3, to 16 feet;</li> <li>5) Class 2 Adjustment to adjust the fencing and tree planting requirements of SRC 702.020(b)(2) along the southern boundary where the subject property abuts a BPA (Bonneville Power Administration) easement;</li> <li>6) Class 2 Adjustment to reduce the tree planting requirement of SRC 702.020(b)(7) around the perimeter of the parking lot;</li> <li>7) Class 2 Adjustment to reduce the setback requirement of SRC 702.020(b)(7) around the perimeter of the parking lot;</li> <li>7) Class 2 Adjustment to reduce the setback requirement of SRC 702.020(c)(1) in certain habitable rooms of Buildings 11, <del>17, 26</del>, <u>14</u>, 30, and 32; and</li> <li>8) Class 2 Adjustment to reduce the setback requirement of SRC 703.020(e)(2), Table Family Residential) zone from approximately 35 feet per SRC 702.020(e)(2), T</li></ul>
CRITERIA:	Salem Revised Code (SRC) Chapters 200.025 – Urban Growth Boundary; 220.005(f)(3) – Class 3 Site Plan Review; 250.005(d)(1) and (2) – Class 2 and Class 1 Adjustment; 804.025(d) – Class 2 Driveway Approach Permit; 225.005(e)(1) – Class 1 Design Review; 205.055(d) – Property Line Adjustment
MORE INFORMATION:	Salem Revised Code (SRC) is available to view at this link: <u>http://bit.ly/salemorcode</u> . Type in the chapter number(s) listed above to view the applicable criteria. All documents and evidence submitted by the applicant are available on the City's online Permit Application Center at <u>https://permits.cityofsalem.net</u> . You can use the search function without registering and enter the permit number listed here: <u>23 121805</u> . Paper copies can be obtained for a reasonable cost.

# **HEARING PROCEDURE:** The hearing will be conducted with the staff presentation first, followed by the applicant's case, neighborhood association comments, persons in favor or opposition, and rebuttal by the applicant, if necessary. The applicant has the burden of proof to show that the approval criteria can be satisfied by the facts. Opponents may rebut the applicant's testimony by showing alternative facts or by showing that the evidence submitted does not satisfy the approval criteria.

Failure to raise an issue prior to the close of the Public Hearing in person or in writing, or failure to provide statements or evidence with sufficient specificity to provide the applicant and Review Authority to respond to the issue, precludes appeal to the Land Use Board of Appeals (LUBA) on this issue. A similar failure to raise constitutional issues relating to proposed conditions of approval precludes an action for damages in circuit court.

Following the close of the Public Hearing, a decision will be issued and mailed to the applicant, property owner, affected neighborhood associations, anyone who participated in the hearing, either in person or in writing, and anyone who requested to receive notice of the decision.

### NOTICE MAILING DATE:

March 19, 2024

### PLEASE PROMPTLY FORWARD A COPY OF THIS NOTICE TO ANY OTHER OWNER, TENANT OR LESSEE. For more information about Planning in Salem: <u>http://www.cityofsalem.net/planning</u>

It is the City of Salem's policy to assure that no person shall be discriminated against on the grounds of race, religion, color, sex, marital status, familial status, national origin, age, mental or physical disability, sexual orientation, gender identity and source of income, as provided by Salem Revised Code Chapter 97. The City of Salem also fully complies with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, and related statutes and regulations, in all programs and activities. Disability-related modification or accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, in order to participate in this meeting or event, are available upon request. Sign language and interpreters for languages other than English are also available upon request. To request such an accommodation or interpretation, contact the Community Development Department at 503-588-6173 at least three business days before this meeting or event. TTD/TTY telephone 503-588-6439 is also available 24/7



G:\CD\PLANNING\Aaron\2024\Site Plan Review\4650 Hazelgreen Road NE\VicinityMap.mxd - 1/24/2024 @ 7:31:33 AM

\_\_\_\_\_

# **NORTHPLACE APARTMENTS PHASE 2 PRELIMINARY PLANS- FOR SITE PLAN REVIEW**



**VICINITY MAP** NOT TO SCALE

	LE	GEND
<u>(ISTING</u>	PROPOSED	
$\odot$	()	STORM DRAIN CLEAN OUT
Ň		STORM DRAIN CATCH BASIN
TX -	*	STORM DRAIN AREA DRAIN

**EXISTING** 

С

 $\bigtriangleup$ 

PROPOSED

 $\leftarrow$ 

-0-

P

С

DECIDUOUS TREE	$\odot$	()	STORM DRAIN CLEAN OUT
	Ň		STORM DRAIN CATCH BASIN
CONIFEROUS TREE	- N		STORM DRAIN AREA DRAIN
FIRE HYDRANT	Q	<b>A</b>	STORM DRAIN MANHOLE
WATER BLOWOFF	Ŷ	Ť	GAS METER
WATER METER			GAS VALVE
WATER VALVE	$\bowtie$	M	GUY WIRE ANCHOR
DOUBLE CHECK VALVE		B	UTILITY POLE
AIR RELEASE VALVE	р	۶	POWER VAULT
SANITARY SEWER CLEAN OUT	0	•	POWER JUNCTION BOX
SANITARY SEWER MANHOLE	0	•	POWER PEDESTAL
SIGN	<del></del>	<b>—</b>	COMMUNICATIONS VAULT
STREET LIGHT	<b>¢</b>	*	COMMUNICATIONS JUNCTION BOX
MAILBOX	MB	(MB)	COMMUNICATIONS RISER

EX

	EXISTING	PROPOSED
RIGHT-OF-WAY LINE		
BOUNDARY LINE		
PROPERTY LINE		
CENTERLINE		
DITCH	> > > _	>>>
CURB		
EDGE OF PAVEMENT		
EASEMENT		
FENCE LINE		<del>-                                    </del>
GRAVEL EDGE		
POWER LINE		
OVERHEAD WIRE	OHW	OHW OHW
COMMUNICATIONS LINE	сом сом сом	сом сом
FIBER OPTIC LINE	CFO CFO CFO	CF0 CF0 CF0
GAS LINE	GAS GAS GAS	GAS GAS GAS
STORM DRAIN LINE	— — — STM — — — STM —	
SANITARY SEWER LINE	SAN SAN SAN SAN	SAN SAN
WATER LINE	WAT WAT WAT	WAT WAT



# **PROPERTY DESCRIPTION**

4680 AND 4650 HAZELGREEN ROAD NE SALEM, OR 97305



# SITE MAP

NOT TO SCALE

TAX LOT 400 AND 500 OF MARION COUNTY ASSESSOR'S MAP 06 2W 32C, LOCATED IN CITY OF SALEM, MARION COUNTY, OREGON.

# **PROPERTY LOCATION**

# **PROJECT PURPOSE**

MULTI-FAMILY COMMUNITY

# **VERTICAL DATUM**

ELEVATIONS ARE BASED ON NGS BENCHMARK NO. 1540, LOCATED AT THE NE CORNER OF THE INTERSECTION OF HWY 99W AND LAKESIDE DRIVE, 51.50 FEET EAST OF THE CENTERLINE OF THE HIGHWAY AND 24.00 FEET NORTH OF THE CENTERLINE OF LAKESIDE DRIVE. ELEVATION = 144.05 FEET (NAVD 88). A VERTCON SHIFT OF -3.346 FEET WAS APPLIÈD TO BRÍNG THE TO NGVD 29.

# ZONING

MULTIPLE FAMILY RESIDENTIAL (RM-2), MIXED USE (MU-1)

# **EXISTING LAND USE**

AGRICULTURAL LAND

### **CIVIL ENGINEERING/** SURVEYING/LAND USE PLANNING/LANDSCAPE **ARCHITECTURE FIRM**

AKS ENGINEERING & FORESTRY, LLC ENGINEERING CONTACT: TYLER ROTH, P.E. PLANNING CONTACT: ZACH PELZ, AICP 3700 RIVER RD N, STE 1 KEIZER, OR 97303 503.400.6028 WWW.AKS-ENG.COM

# ARCHITECT

MULTI/TECH ENGINEERING SERVICES, INC. CONTÁCT: MARK GRENZ, P.E. 1155 13TH ST SE SALEM, OR 97302 PH: 503.363.9227

# **GEOTECHNICAL FIRM**

REDMOND GEOTECHNICAL SERVICES, LLC CONTACT: DANIEL M. REDMOND, P.E., G.E. P.O. BOX 20547 PORTLAND, OR 97294 PH: 503.285.0598

SHEE
------

P1.0	COV
P2.0	EXIS
P3.0	LOT
P4.0	PRE
P5.0	PRE
P5.1	PRE
P6.0	PRE
P6.1	PRE
P7.0	PRE
P7.1	PRE
P8.0	HAZ
P8.1	HAZ
P8.2	HAZ
P9.0	LUN
P9.1	LUN
P10.0	PRE
P10.1	PRE
P10.2	PRE



# **OWNER/APPLICANT**

I&E CONSTRUCTION, INC. 27375 SW PARKWAY AVE. WILSONVILLE, OR 97070 PH: 503.655.7933

# T INDEX

VER SHEET KISTING CONDITIONS MAP T CONSOLIDATION PLAN RELIMINARY ONSITE DEMOLITION PLAN RELIMINARY SITE PLAN – NORTH RELIMINARY SITE PLAN – SOUTH RELIMINARY GRADING AND DRAINAGE PLAN - NORTH RELIMINARY GRADING AND DRAINAGE PLAN - SOUTH RELIMINARY ONSITE UTILITY PLAN - NORTH RELIMINARY ONSITE UTILITY PLAN – SOUTH ZELGREEN RD TYPICAL SECTION AND PLAN AZELGREEN RD DEMOLITION PLAN AZELGREEN RD PLAN, PROFILE, AND UTILITY PLAN JNAR DRIVE PLAN AND PROFILE JNAR DRIVE PLAN AND PROFILE RELIMINARY LANDSCAPE PLAN - NORTH RELIMINARY LANDSCAPE PLAN – SOUTH RELIMINARY LANDSCAPE SCHEDULE AND NOTES



# N Ш S Ω LMEN. ſ Ζ 0 SHEE СШ S O E C N OVER **O** <sup>m</sup> **J** ŭ ≅ ŭ ENEWS: DECEMBER 31, 2024 8321 JOB NUMBER: 12/15/2023 DATE: DESIGNED BY: TDR TBD DRAWN BY:

TDR

CHECKED BY:

**P1.0** 



OF BUILDING PERMIT SUBMITTAL.

- 3. 26' DRIVEWAY APPROACH PER CITY STANDARDS
- 4. 24' DRIVEWAY APPROACH PER CITY STANDARDS
- WITH ADJACENT PROPERTY OWNER
- PROPOSED TRANSIT STOP
- 8. TRANSIT STOP ALONG WESTERN SIDE OF LUNAR DR NE FINAL LOCATION TO BE DETERMINED

### SITE SUMMARY TOTAL SITE AREA =

PROJECT AREA = TOTAL UNITS PROVIDED = TOTAL OPEN SPACE =

RM-2 ZONE DATA RM-2 ZONE AREA = IMPERVIOUS AREA =

DENSITY: ALLOWED (MINIMUM) = ALLOWED (MAXIMUM) = (PROVIDED =

OPEN SPACE: REQUIRED OPEN SPACE = PROVIDED OPEN SPACE =

LOT COVERAGE (BUILDS AND ACCESSORY STRUCTURES): LOT COVERAGE ALLOWED =  $\pm 330,181$  SF (60%) LOT COVERAGE PROVIDED =  $\pm 135,281$  SF (25%)

<u>SETBACKS:</u> ABUTTING STREET:

INTERIOR FRONT: INTERIOR SIDE: INTERIOR REAR: VEHICLE AREA:

ZONE TO ZONE SETBACKS: RESIDENTIAL ZONE:

ABUTTING INDUSTRIAL ZONES: BUILDINGS: ACCESSORY STRUCTURES MIN. 15 FT VEHICLE USE AREA:

MU-1 ZONE DATA MU-1 ZONE AREA = IMPERVIOUS AREA = <u>DENSITY:</u> ALLOWED (MAXIMUM) = (MAXIMUM)

ALLOWED (MINIMUM) = PROVIDED =

BUILDING FRONTAGE: HAZELGREEN RD NE REQUIRED = \_ PROVIDED = lunar dr ne REQUIRED =

PROVIDED =

ABUTTING STREET: MAX. 10 FT INTERIOR SIDE: REFER TO ZONE TO ZONE INTERIOR REAR: REFER TO ZONE TO ZONE VEHICLE USE AREA: REFER TO ZONE TO ZONE

ALLOWED MAXIMUM:

> <u>Parking provided:</u> OFF-Street Parking STANDARD

COMPACT TOTAL PARKING PROVIDED =

LOADING ZONES REQUIRED = PROVIDED =

REQUIRED BICYCLE PARKING = PROVIDED BICYCLE PARKING BIKE RACK = 1ST FLOOR = TOTAL =

±679,449 SF (±15.60 ACRES) ±679,449 SF (±15.60 ACRES) 405 UNITS ±247,336 SF (±5.68 ACRES)

±598,188 SF (13.73 ACRES) ±422,075 SF (70.56%)

183 UNITS (15 UNITS/ACRE) 379 UNITS (31 UNITS/ACRE) 360 UNITS (26.2 UNITS/ACRE) (INCLUDES 3 UNITS OF BUILDING 12)

±179,456 SF (4.12 ACRES) ±234,394 SF (5.38 ACRES)

MIN. 12 FT PLUS 1 FT FOR EACH 1 FT OF HEIGHT OVER 12 FT, BUT NEED NOT EXCEED 20 FT IN DEPTH. (SETBACK SHOWN ON PLAN = 20 FT). REFER TO ZONE TO ZONE REFER TO ZONE TO ZONE REFER TO ZONE TO ZONE REFER TO ZONE TO ZONE

MIN. 1 FOOT FOR EACH 1 FOOT OF BUILDING HEIGHT, BUT IN NO CASE LESS THAN 20 FT (PER SRC 702.020) MIN. 15 FT

MIN. 15 FT

±81,267 SF (1.87 ACRES) ±59,557 SF (73.29%)

NONE 29 UNITS (15 UNITS/ACRE) 45 UNITS (29.8 UNITS/ACRE) (INCLUDES 9 UNITS OF BUILDING 12)

±188.71 FT (75%) ±208 FT (83%)

±104 FT (40%) ±104 FT (40%)

695 SPACES (1.2/STUDIO, 1.75/OTHER UNITS)

547 SPACES (INCLUDES 21 ACCESSIBLE) 13 SPACES (INCLUDES 0 ACCESSIBLE) 560 SPACES

3 (200 OR MORE DWELLING UNITS)

0 6 15 ORIGINAL PAGE SIZE: 22" x 34"

405 SPACES (1/UNIT) 278

127 405 (1/UNIT)









TDR

DRAWN BY:

CHECKED BY:





Ζ

Ζ

O

CTI

СШ

SO

ŌΣ

ОШ

S/ S/

Ζ

Ш

G

μ

Ω

SITE

ſ

4

LIMIN

ШК

Ω

DATE:

DRAWN BY:

E

THP

Ω

Ο

Ζ

PRELIMINATION FORTON

RENEWS: DECEMBER 31, 2024

**P5.1** 





AKS DRAWING FILE: 8321 PRELIM LANDSCAPE.DWG | LAYOUT: P10.

**GENERAL NOTE** 

REFER TO SHEET P10.2 FOR PLANT SCHEDULE AND GENERAL LANDSCAPE NOTES.







JOB NUMBER:	8321
DATE:	12/15/2023
DESIGNED BY:	JRH
DRAWN BY:	JRH
CHECKED BY:	TEB

P10.0





REFER TO SHEET P10.2 FOR PLANT SCHEDULE AND GENERAL LANDSCAPE NOTES.







P10.1

# **PLANT SCHEDULE - ONSITE**

TREES		BOTANICAL NAME	COMMON NAME	SIZE/CONTAINER	SPACING
	<u>×11</u>				
	32	ACER RUBRUM 'BOWHALL'	BOWHALL RED MAPLE	1.5" CAL. B&B	AS SHOW
	20	CALOCEDRUS DECURRENS	INCENSE CEDAR	6' HT. B&B	AS SHOW
$\langle \rangle$	125	POPULUS TREMULOIDES 'ERECTA'	COLUMNAR QUAKING ASPEN	1.5" CAL. B&B	AS SHOW
	5	PSEUDOTSUGA MENZIESII	DOUGLAS FIR	6' HT. B&B	AS SHOW
$\langle \cdot \rangle$	105	PYRUS X 'NCPX1'	JAVELIN PEAR	1.5" CAL. B&B	AS SHOW
	4	THUJA PLICATA	WESTERN RED CEDAR	6' HT. B&B	AS SHOW
·	62	ZELKOVA SERRATA 'GREEN VASE'	GREEN VASE ZELKOVA	1.5" CAL. B&B	as show
<u>STREET TREES</u>	QTY	BOTANICAL NAME	COMMON NAME	<u>SIZE/CONTAINER</u>	<u>SPACING</u>
y w w	41	TILIA CORDATA 'GREENSPIRE'	GREENSPIRE LITTLELEAF LINDEN	2" CAL. B&B	AS SHOW
and the second s	9	ULMUS AMERICANA 'NEW HARMONY'	NEW HARMONY AMERICAN ELM	2" CAL. B&B	AS SHOW
<u>Shrubs</u>	<u>QTY</u>	BOTANICAL NAME	COMMON NAME	SIZE/CONTAINER	<u>SPACING</u>
	53	ACER CIRCINATUM	VINE MAPLE	5 GAL. CONT./30" HT. MIN.	96" o.c.
$\odot$	453	ESCALLONIA X 'COMPACTA'	COMPACT ESCALLONIA	3 GAL. CONT.	48" o.c.
	79	MAHONIA REPENS	CREEPING MAHONIA	1 GAL. CONT.	36" o.c.
$\odot$	551	MISCANTHUS SINENSIS 'MORNING LIGHT'	MORNING LIGHT EULALIA GRASS	3 GAL. CONT.	48" o.c.
*	1,329	PENNISETUM ALOPECUROIDES 'HAMELN'	HAMELN FOUNTAIN GRASS	1 GAL CONT.	30" o.c.
	345	PIERIS JAPONICA 'MOUNTAIN FIRE'	MOUNTAIN FIRE JAPANESE PIERIS	3 GAL CONT.	48" o.c.
(i)	289	PRUNUS LAUROCERASUS 'OTTO LUYKEN'	OTTO LUYKEN ENGLISH LAUREL	3 GAL. CONT.	48" o.c.
$(\mathcal{D})$	329	RHODODENDRON X 'P.J.M.'	PJM RHODODENDRON	3 GAL CONT.	48" o.c.
(+)	586	ROSA X 'NOATRAUM'	FLOWER CARPET PINK ROSE	1 GAL. CONT.	42" o.c.
٥	30	THUJA OCCIDENTALIS 'SMARAGD'	EMERALD GREEN ARBORVITAE	6' HT. CONT.	36" o.c.
$\odot$	333	VIBURNUM DAVIDII	DAVID VIBURNUM	3 GAL. CONT.	42" o.c.
GROUND COVERS	QTY	BOTANICAL NAME	COMMON NAME	SIZE/CONTAINER	<u>Spacing</u>
+     +     +       +     +     +       +     +     +       +     +     +       +     +     +       +     +     +	944	RUBUS CALYCINOIDES	CREEPING BRAMBLE	1 GAL CONT.	36" o.c.
$ \begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\ \\$	±33,564 SF	STORMWATER FACILITY SHALL BE PLANTE	D TO CITY OF SALEM STANDARDS		
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	±120,887 SF	LAWN: SUNMARK SEEDS NORTHWEST SUP LBS PER 1,000 SF OR AS RECOMMENDED RYEGRASS/LOLIMUM PERENNE (35%); DAS	BY SUPPLIER. MIX COMPOSITION BY	WEIGHT: CUTTER II PERENNIAL	

RYEGRASS/LOLIMUM PERENNE (35%); DASHER III PERENNIAL RYEGRASS/LOLIMUM PERENNE (35%); GARNET CREEPING RED FESCUE/FESTUCA RUBRA (15%); WINDWARD CHEWINGS FESCUE/FESTUCA RUBRA SPP LONGIFOLIA (15%).

### **GENERAL LANDSCAPE NOTES**

- 1. PLAN REVISIONS INCLUDING CHANGES TO PLANT SPECIES, SIZES, SPACING, QUANTITIES, ETC., DUE TO PLANT AVAILABILITY OR UNFORESEEN SITE CONDITIONS MAY BE APPROVED PRIOR TO INSTALLATION WHERE ALLOWABLE BY THE CITY OF SALEM'S DESIGN STANDARDS. SUBSTITUTIONS SHALL BE OF EQUAL FORM AND FUNCTION.
- 2. CONTRACTOR IS RESPONSIBLE FOR VERIFYING PLANT AND MATERIAL QUANTITIES PRIOR TO BIDDING AND CONSTRUCTION AND FOR FAMILIARIZING THEMSELVES WITH SITE CONDITIONS. SHOULD DISCREPANCIES OCCUR, DESIGN INTENT PREVAILS OVER QUANTITIES LISTED.
- 3. ALL PLANTS AND INSTALLATION SHALL CONFORM TO THE CITY OF SALEM'S LANDSCAPE DESIGN STANDARDS AND TO THE AMERICAN STANDARDS FOR NURSERY STOCK, ANSI Z60.1, CURRENT EDITION, IN ALL WAYS. PLANT IN ACCORDANCE WITH BEST PRACTICE STANDARDS, SUCH AS THOSE ADOPTED BY THE OREGON LANDSCAPE CONTRACTOR'S BOARD (OLCB) AND THE AMERICAN HORTICULTURE INDUSTRY ASSOCIATION (AMERICAN HORT). FIELD ADJUST PLANT LOCATIONS AS NECESSARY TO AVOID CONFLICTS WITH UTILITIES, METERS, LIGHTS, TREE CANOPIES, BUILDING OVERHANGS, ETC.
- 4. ALL LANDSCAPING SHALL BE INSTALLED AT THE TIME OF CONSTRUCTION UNLESS OTHERWISE APPROVED BY THE CITY OF SALEM DUE TO INCLEMENT WEATHER OR TEMPORARY SITE CONDITIONS. UPON INSTALLATION, ALL PLANT MATERIALS SHALL BE VIGOROUS, WELL-BRANCHED AND WITH HEALTHY, WELL-FURNISHED ROOT SYSTEMS, FREE OF DISEASE, INSECT PESTS AND INJURIES.
- 5. DOUBLE STAKE ALL TREES UNLESS OTHERWISE SPECIFIED. TREES SHALL BE PLANTED NO CLOSER THAN 2' O.C. FROM SIDEWALKS, CURBING, OR OTHER HARDSCAPING; NO CLOSER THAN 6' O.C. FROM ACCESS WALKWAYS, FIRE HYDRANTS, ROOF DRAINS CATCH BASINS, MANHOLES, WATER METERS, GAS AND ELECTRIC SERVICES, UTILITY BOXES AND VAULTS, AND MOUNTED PEDESTALS; NO CLOSER THAN 10' O.C. FROM ALLEYS, DRIVEWAYS, TRAFFIC SIGNALS, STREET LIGHT STANDARDS AND UTILITY LINES. TREES IN PLANTING ISLANDS SHALL BE CENTERED IN ISLAND. REFER ALSO TO THE CITY OF SALEM STANDARD TREE-SHRUB PLANTING DETAIL NO. 803 (SHEET L1.1)
- 6. PLANTING AND INSTALLATION OF ALL REQUIRED LANDSCAPING SHALL BE INSPECTED AND APPROVED PRIOR TO THE ISSUANCE OF A CERTIFICATE OF OCCUPANCY UNLESS OTHERWISE APPROVED BY THE CITY OF SALEM.
- 7. SOIL PREPARATION: ALL SHRUB BEDS SHALL HAVE A MINIMUM OF 12" OF CLEAN TOPSOIL. EXISTING NATIVE SOIL OR STOCKPILED TOPSOIL STRIPPINGS MAY BE USED. TOPSOIL SHALL BE RICH DARK BROWN IN COLOR AND VOID OF ROOTS, PLANTS, WEEDS, SEEDS, SOD, STONES, CLAY LUMPS, ALKALI SALTS, DEBRIS, AND OTHER EXTRANEOUS MATERIALS HARMFUL TO PLANT GROWTH. IF IMPORTED TOPSOIL IS REQUIRED CONTRACTOR SHALL LOOSEN SUBSOIL TO A MINIMUM DEPTH OF 18" AND REMOVE ANY DEBRIS OR MATERIAL THAT MAY INHIBIT HEALTHY PLANT GROWTH PRIOR TO INSTALLATION OF TOPSOIL. IF NATIVE SOIL TO BE USED BECOMES COMPACTED DURING CONSTRUCTION ACTIVITY, CONTRACTOR SHALL LOOSEN TO A MINIMUM OF 12" AND AMEND EXISTING TOPSOIL WITH 2" OF VEGETATIVE COMPOST (SUCH AS COMPOSTED YARD WASTE) TILLED INTO THE SOIL. TOPSOIL SHALL BE PLACED OR WORKED IN FRIABLE (WORKABLE) CONDITION. SOIL SHALL NOT BE WORKED WHEN SATURATED TO PREVENT OVER-COMPACTION. FINISH GRADE OF ALL NEW PLANTINGS SHALL SEAMLESSLY MEET FINISH GRADE OF ANY EXISTING LANDSCAPE AREAS TO REMAIN AND AS INDICATED ON GRADING PLANS. PLANTING BED AREAS SHALL PROVIDE POSITIVE DRAINAGE AS INDICATED ON THE GRADING PLANS AND BE FREE OF HOLES, DIVOTS, OR HIGH/LOW SPOTS WHICH MAY CAUSE WATER TO COLLECT. BACKFILL PLANTING HOLES WITH A MIXTURE OF 1/3 ORGANIC MATERIAL, 1/3 TOPSOIL, AND 1/3 SANDY LOAM. SOIL FOR STREET TREES SHALL BE PREPARED AND AMENDED TO A WIDTH OF AT LEAST 3 TIMES THE SIZE OF THE ROOT BALL.
- 8. A PERMANENT UNDERGROUND IRRIGATION SYSTEM WITH A BACKFLOW DEVICE APPROVED BY THE CITY OF SALEM, SHALL BE PROVIDED FOR ALL LANDSCAPED AREAS WITHIN THE PROJECT WORK AREA FOR THE ESTABLISHMENT AND LONG-TERM HEALTH OF PLANT MATERIAL. THE IRRIGATION SYSTEM SHALL BE 'DESIGN-BUILD' BY THE LANDSCAPE CONTRACTOR, USING CURRENT WATER-SAVING TECHNOLOGY, AND INCLUDE ALL MATERIALS, COMPONENTS, CITY APPROVED BACKFLOW OR ANTI-SIPHON DEVICES, VALVES, ETC. NECESSARY FOR THE COMPLETE AND EFFICIENT COVERAGE OF LANDSCAPE AREAS SHOWN. THE LANDSCAPE CONTRACTOR SHALL COORDINATE WITH THE GENERAL CONTRACTOR AND OWNER FOR IRRIGATION POINT-OF-CONNECTION (P.O.C.), SLEEVING LOCATION, CONTROLLER, POWER SOURCE, AND MAINLINE LAYOUT PRIOR TO ANY PAVING REPAIR OR STRIPING. CONTRACTOR SHALL PROVIDE THE CITY OF SALEM WITH AN IRRIGATION PLAN INCLUDING ZONING AND COMPONENT LAYOUT FOR APPROVAL PRIOR TO INSTALLATION AS A DELAYED SUBMITTAL.
- 9. THE OWNER SHALL BE RESPONSIBLE FOR MAINTAINING ALL LANDSCAPE MATERIAL IN GOOD CONDITION SO AS TO PRESENT A HEALTHY, NEAT AND ORDERLY APPEARANCE IN KEEPING WITH CURRENT INDUSTRY STANDARDS. UNHEALTHY OR DEAD PLANT MATERIALS SHALL BE REPLACED IN CONFORMANCE TO THE REQUIREMENTS OF THE ORIGINALLY APPROVED LANDSCAPE PLAN.
- 10. MULCH: APPLY 3" DEEP WELL-AGED DARK HEMLOCK OR FIR, MEDIUM GRIND, UNDER AND AROUND ALL PLANTS IN PLANTING BEDS. DO NOT COVER FOLIAGE OR ROOT CROWNS OF PLANT MATERIAL WITH MULCH. MULCH SHALL BE AT LEAST 12" AWAY FROM ROOT FLARE OF TREE, THE FLARE SHALL REMAIN VISIBLE AND EXPOSED TO AT LEAST FINISH GRADE.
- 11. GROUNDCOVER SHALL NOT BE PLANTED CLOSER THAN 24" FROM CATCH BASINS OR DRAIN AREAS. SHRUBS SHALL NOT BE PLANTED CLOSER THAN 36" FROM CATCH BASINS AND BUILDING FOUNDATIONS. NO LANDSCAPE PLANT/GROUNDCOVER SHALL BE PLACED WITHIN 3' OF ANY NEW TREE.

### **RM-2 ZONE LANDSCAPE DATA**

RM-2 ZONE AREA: ±598,188 SF 360 UNITS (INCLUDES 3 UNITS OF BUILDING 12)

COMMON OPEN SPACE REQUIRED: 5,550 SF (1,000 SF PLUS AN ADDITIONAL 250 SF FOR EVERY 20, OR PORTION THEREOF, OVER 20 UNITS) COMMON OPEN SPACE PROVIDED: 5,601 SF MINIMUM DIMENSIONS REQUIRED: 20' ALL SIDES AND 500 SF:

MINIMUM DIMENSIONS PROVIDED: EXCEEDS

MINIMUM SITE TREES PER 702.020(b)(2)(a) REQUIRED (1 PER 2,000 SF GROSS SITE AREA): 299 TREES

TOTAL PROPOSED SITE TREES: 332 (EXCLUDES STREET TREES)

2 SHRUB P.U. AT EACH PRIMARY BUILDING ENTRANCE REQUIRED: 70 P.U.

SHRUB P.U. PROPOSED: 70 P.U.

10 TREE P.U. PER 60 LF OF BUILDING EXTERIOR, WITHIN 25 FT OF BUILDING (13,520 LF / 60 LF X 10): 2,253 TREE P.U. REQUIRED TREE P.U. PROPOSED: 2,260 P.U.

1 SHRUB P.U. PER 15 LF OF BUILDING EXTERIOR (13,520 LF / 15 LF): 901 SHRUB P.U. SHRUB P.U. PROPOSED: 6,559 P.U.

PARKING LOT LANDSCAPING

PARKING PERIMETER (7,729 LF) TREES REQUIRED 1 PER 50 LF: 148 PARKING PERIMETER TREES PROVIDED: 236 PARKING BAY TREES REQUIRED (1 PER BAY): 64 PARKING BAY TREES PROVIDED: 65

### **MU-1 ZONE LANDSCAPE DATA**

MU-1 ZONE AREA:  $\pm 81,267$  SF

PARKING LOT LANDSCAPING PARKING LOT IMPERVIOUS AREA: 20,141 SF INTERIOR PARKING LOT LANDSCAPING REQUIRED (MIN 8%): 1,611 SF

INTERIOR PARKING LOT LANDSCAPING PROVIDED: 1,962 SF (10%)

PARKING LOT TREES REQUIRED (MIN 1 TREE PER 12 PARKING SPACES): 5 TREES PARKING LOT TREES PROVIDED: 7 TREES



S

### Ш́Н 0 Z **N** Ζ S, 4 Ш T U, Ι C S $\geq$ Ш Δ ſ Ζ C S Ω Ζ Ζ Ο $\mathbf{O}$ щ ſ Ω 4 ЧН SO Ζ FΟΣ СШ C ШК 0 ιШ Š Ζ Ω S RECISTER 070

JOB NUMBER:	8321
DATE:	12/15/2023
DESIGNED BY:	JRH
DRAWN BY:	JRH
CHECKED BY:	TEB

P10.2



.

### LAND USE APPEAL APPLICATION

1.	GENERAL DATA REQUIRED [to be completed by the appellant]		
	UGA-SPR-ADJ-DAP-DR-PLA24-03	February 29, 2024	
	Case # Being Appealed	Decision Date	
	4650 Hazelgreen Rd NE, Sal	em, OR 97305	
	Address of Subject Property		
	4795 Apollo Ave NE, Salem,	OR 97305	
	Appellants Mailing Address with zip code		
	sdschulke@gmail.com	(503) 580-8597	
	Appellant's E-mail Address	Day-time Phone / Cell Phone	
	Yasha Renner, AAL Name yasha@rennerlawfirm.com E-Mail Address	429 N. Water St. Ste B, Silverton, OR 97381 Mailing Address with ZIP Code (503) 770-4040 Day-time Phone / Cell Phone	
2.	SIGNATURES OF ALL APPELLANTS Signature:	Date: 3/13/24	
		Date	
	Printed Name: Steven Schulke		
	Signature:	Date:	
	Printed Name:		

3. <u>**REASON FOR APPEAL</u>** Attach a letter, briefly summarizing the reason for the Appeal. Describe how the proposal does not meet the applicable criteria as well as verification establishing the appellants standing to appeal the decision as provided under SRC 300.1010</u>

FOR STAFF USE ONLY Received By: Aaron Panko	Date: 3-14-2024	Receipt No: 24-106369-GP
Appeal Deadline: <u>3-15-2024, 5:00 P</u> M	Case Manager: <u>Aaron</u>	Panko



429 N. Water St. Suite B Silverton, OR 97381 *Ph:* (503) 770-4040 *Fx:* (503) 300-1784

Mr. Yasha Renner Attorney at Law YASHA@RENNERLAWFIRM.COM

March 14, 2024

### BY FIRST CLASS MAIL AND EMAIL Planning Division 555 Liberty Street SE Salem, OR 97301 Email: planning@cityofsalem.net

### Re: NOTICE OF REPRESENTATION AND APPEAL (SRC 300.1010 et seq.) Case No: UGA-SPR-ADJ-DAP-DR-PLA24-03 Subject Property: Tax Lot 400 (Tax Map 06 2W 32C)

### To: Hearings Officer

Please be advised that this law firm represents Steven Shulke ("Appellant"), an aggrieved party with standing to appeal the following land-use decisions in the above-referenced case. This letter specifies my client's reasons for appeal pursuant to Salem Revised Code (SRC) 300.1020.

### I. DECISION(S) APPEALED

The following decision of the Planning Administrator is appealed:

Class 2 Adjustment to adjust the fencing and tree planting requirements of SRC 702.020(b)(2) along the southern boundary where the subject property abuts a BPA (Bonneville Power Administration) easement.

### II. STANDING

Appellant is the owner of record of the real property located at 4795 Apollo Ave NE, Salem, OR 97305, which is zoned RS (single family residential) and abuts the proposed development of the subject property located at 4650 Hazelgreen Road NE, Salem, OR 97305 (the "Subject Property"). Appellant submitted comments during the public comment period and received a notice of decision dated February 29, 2024. Accordingly, Appellant has standing to appeal under SRC 300.520(f)(2).

### III. REASONS FOR APPEAL

### (A) Applicable Criteria for Granting a Class 2 Adjustment.

The foregoing decision on appeal was requested and granted as a Class 2 adjustment, which is defined as "an adjustment to any development standard in the UDC other than a Class 1 adjustment, including an adjustment to any numerical development standard in the UDC that increases or decreases the standard by more than 20 percent." SRC 250.005(a)(1)(B).

March 14, 2024 Page 2 of 5 Case No: UGA-SPR-ADJ-DAP-DR-PLA24-03

The criteria for granting a Class 2 adjustment are set forth in SRC 250.005(d)(2), which requires the proposed adjustment to satisfy all of the following elements:

- (A) The purpose underlying the specific development standard proposed for adjustment is:
  - (i) Clearly inapplicable to the proposed development; or
  - (ii) Equally or better met by the proposed development.
- (B) If located within a residential zone, the proposed development will not detract from the livability or appearance of the residential area.
- (C) If more than one adjustment has been requested, the cumulative effect of all the adjustments result in a project which is still consistent with the overall purpose of the zone.

SRC 250.005(d)(2) (emphasis added).

### (B) Analysis of Land-Use Decision on Appeal

SRC 702.020(b)(2) provides, in pertinent part:

Where a development site abuts property that is zoned... Single Family Residential (RS), *a combination of landscaping and screening* shall be provided to *buffer* between the multiple family development and the abutting... RS zoned property. The landscaping and screening shall include the following:

(A) A minimum of one tree, not less than 1.5 inches in caliper, for every 30 linear feet of abutting property width; and

(B) a minimum six-foot tall, decorative, sight-obscuring fence or wall. The fence or wall shall be constructed of materials commonly used in the construction of fences and walls, such as wood, stone, rock, brick, or other durable materials. Chainlink fencing with slats shall be not allowed to satisfy this standard.

### SRC 702.020(b)(2).

For purposes of applying this standard, the term *abutting* means "touching along a boundary or point." SRC 111.001.

As a preliminary matter, it must be noted that the specific design review standard at issue contemplates the installation of landscaping and screening *on the Subject Property* that is owned by the applicant, not on the abutting property owned by Appellant. Logically, because a tree cannot be planted along the same line where a fence or wall is installed, one must be situated behind the other. Thus, for example, trees may be planted either behind or in front of the required screening, but SRC 702.020(b)(2) is silent regarding the distance between these design features. In any case, it goes without saying that the term *abutting* is not to be strictly construed for purposes of this design standard, but rather embraces some degree of reasonable discretion in planning the physical location of these design elements upon the Subject Property.

March 14, 2024 Page 3 of 5 Case No: UGA-SPR-ADJ-DAP-DR-PLA24-03

Moreover, SRC 702.020(b)(2) requires a "combination" of both (1) landscaping with living trees and (2) screening with a sight-obscuring fence or wall. These are separate and complementary requirements under SRC 702.020(b)(2), which specifies intrinsically different materials: a natural landscaping feature, on the one hand, together with a man-made structure on the other. The structural design feature must also be "decorative" according to the design review standard. Accordingly, any proposed adjustment that does not include *both* design elements—that is, natural landscaping and non-natural decorative screening—cannot fulfill the underlying purposes of the standard because it is not "equally or better met" by the proposed development.

As stated in SRC 702.020(b)(2), that underlying purpose is to provide a "buffer" between the multiple family development and the abutting RS zoned property. Further, the underlying purpose of all landscaping and screening standards applicable under the Unified Development Code (UDC) is to "improve the appearance and visual character of the community, promote compatibility between land uses . . . and preserve and enhance the livability of the City." SRC 807.001 (stating purpose of landscaping and screening standards under SRC chapter 807).

Nonetheless, the Planning Administrator granted the proposed adjustment for the following reasons stated in the notice of decision (pages 34–35, emphasis added):

The applicant indicates that the reason for the request to reduce the tree planting and fencing is because of the existing 125-foot-wide easement for a BPA (Bonneville Power administration) transmission line. The easement extends across the entire southern boundary of the property with a width of approximately 16 feet on the subject property and 109 feet on the abutting RS (Single Family Residential) zoned properties to the south. No buildings or structures can occur within the easement, including fencing. *Trees and vegetation exceeding a height of five feet are also not permitted in the easement area; therefore, it is not possible to provide the required buffering along the southern property line in the easement area.* The applicant proposes to landscape the southern boundary with dense shrubs that will provide a physical and visual barrier and will be maintained in compliance with the requirements of the BPA easement. The proposal equally or better meets the intent of this provision and is therefore in compliance with this criterion.

As noted, the BPA power-line easement constitutes a nonpossessory interest in private lands. As such, it is a private easement and restriction on the use of land. But the UDC expressly provides that it "shall be applied independently of, *and without regard to*, any private easement, covenant, condition, restriction, or other legally enforceable interest in, or obligation imposed on, the use or development of land." SRC 110.060(a) (emphasis added). "In those instances where the UDC imposes a greater restriction or higher standards than required by an easement, covenant, condition, restriction, or other agreement between private parties, *or where the UDC otherwise conflicts with those private party agreements, the UDC shall control.*" SRC 110.060(b) (emphasis added).

Therefore, the land-use restrictions and rights incident to the BPA power-line easement are immaterial for purposes of the application of SRC 702.020(b)(2). The Planning Administrator erred by considering and granting an adjustment on this basis, and the decision constitutes a modification of the *applicability* of a requirement that is expressly prohibited by SRC 250.005(a)(2)(E).

March 14, 2024 Page 4 of 5 Case No: UGA-SPR-ADJ-DAP-DR-PLA24-03

Further, with respect to the purported building restrictions due to BPA's easement, it should be noted that the applicant proposes to build a 6-foot perimeter fence along the eastern boundary of the Subject Property in compliance with the requirements of SRC 702.020(b)(2). As shown on the preliminary site plan (P5.1), the fence will, in fact, extend into the BPA easement area a distance of approximately 16 feet. This undermines the applicant's purported rationale for seeking an adjustment in the first place. Even if it is true that the terms of the easement prohibit construction of a fence or wall within the easement area, then the adjustment that should have been requested (and granted) is to relocate both the fence and trees, by moving both design features backward a distance of about 16 feet from the abutting property line in order to clear the easement area.

Notwithstanding SRC 110.060, which is dispositive, the proposed development, as adjusted, does not satisfy the criteria set forth in SRC 250.005(d). The applicant "proposes to landscape the southern boundary with dense shrubs that will provide a physical and visual barrier." *Notice of Decision* 34–35. The species of shrubs are identified on the applicant's plant schedule as *Mahonia Repens* (Creeping Mahonia) and *Prunus Laurocerasus* (Otto Luyken English Laurel), with *Rubus Calycinoides* (Creeping Bramble) as ground cover.

A dwarf form of the larger English Laurel, Otto Luyken English (or Cherry) Laurel is an evergreen shrub that typically grows 3 feet tall and spreads 6 to 8 feet. The plant's fruit, leaves, and stems are poisonous to humans. As shown on the preliminary site plan (P10.1), this species will be planted along the southernmost boundary for the Subject Property. Just behind these, the applicant intends to plant Creeping Mahona (also known as Creeping Oregon Grape), which is an extremely short, sprawling shrub that commonly grows no more than 8 to 12 inches and occasionally up to 2 feet. Suffice it to say, these two plant species, even when fully mature, cannot and will not provide an equal measure of privacy, nor visual character, nor buffer between the Subject Property and Appellant's property than trees (one tree for every 30 linear feet of abutting property width) and the 6-foot decorative fence or wall that is required by SRC 702.020(b)(2). Therefore, the proposed development does not *equally* meet the underlying purposes of this specific development standard.

As explained above, the underlying purpose of SRC 702.020(b)(2) is not merely to create a physical and visual obstruction, however dense, between the proposed multi-family development and RS zoned properties. Rather, the development standard uses the term *buffer*, which has a much wider connotation than the word *obstruction*, and embraces not only the privacy of the abutting RS-zoned property owners—specifically by means of a 6-foot tall decorative fence or wall. Additionally, the term *buffer* includes a protective element due to the incompatibility of land uses and the "nuisances" that will result from having a large multi-family apartment complex 125 feet from Appellant's back yard. A sight-obscuring fence or wall is designed to contain and buffer these nuisance activities, such as vehicle headlights from the nearby parking lot, trash and litter carried by wind, or even potential foot traffic. By contrast, a hedge of low- (and slow-)growing shrubs is not sufficient to provide an equally effective barrier. The hedgerow will take time to grow and spread, several years perhaps, but in the mean time there will be 4-foot gaps between each laurel.

Finally, as discussed above, SRC 702.020(b)(2) requires a combination of natural and nonnatural design elements, the purpose of which is to "improve the appearance and visual character of the community, promote compatibility between land uses . . . and preserve and enhance the livability March 14, 2024 Page 5 of 5 Case No: UGA-SPR-ADJ-DAP-DR-PLA24-03

of the City." SRC 807.001. Absent a decorative wall or fencing, a hedgerow cannot equally meet any of these purposes. Indeed, as landscaping design features, the tree and screening requirements under SRC 702.020(b)(2) are therefore intended to preserve the livability of the City, as well as to *enhance* that livability. At a minimum, these underlying purposes must be equally met by the proposed development. Appellant has grown up and worked in the City of Salem for most of his life. For him, the livability of the City will undoubtedly be adversely impacted by the lack of adequate screening between the proposed development and his home.

For the foregoing reasons, this appeal is respectfully submitted for a final decision.

Sincerely, Jasha ham Yasha Renner